

A Comparison of Approaches to Native Hawaiian Self Governance & Sovereignty

This table, developed by the CNHA Policy Center, hopes to assist individuals interested in comparing the very basic elements of Native Hawaiian self governance and sovereignty as proposed by three of the most commonly held positions by various groups and organizations in Hawaii today:

- 1) Proponents of **Federal Recognition** of a government-to-government relationship with the United States similar to other Native groups and tribes that provides for Dual Citizenship;
- 2) Proponents of **Decolonization** and the establishment of a Hawaiian Nation with Singular Citizenship; and
- 3) Proponents of **De-occupation** through the reinstatement of the Hawaiian Kingdom with Singular Citizenship.

For more information or any inquiries, contact the CNHA Policy Center at policy@hawaiiancouncil.org.

	Issue	Native Hawaiian Government with <u>Dual Citizenship</u> Federal Recognition Advocates	Hawaiian Nation with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Other Advocates	Hawaiian Kingdom Government with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Kingdom Advocates
1.	How Achieved?	<i>Native Hawaiians enrolled in the Kanaiolowalu Base Roll ratify a constitution, begin operating autonomously, seek formal recognition as a Native government by the U.S. U.S. and State of Hawaii continue to exist.</i>	<i>Get UN to reinstate Hawaii on the decolonization list, U.S. leaves Hawaii under negotiated terms, State of Hawaii dissolved.</i>	<i>Get U.S. and military to leave Hawaii, State of Hawaii dissolved.</i>
2.	What is Precedent for Approach?	<i>Precedent exists with the U.S. Over 560 Native Nations have dual citizenship that operate autonomously, including work at the UN and international arena.</i>	<i>Precedent does not exist with the U.S. There currently is no mechanism to “undo” a state of the United States. Only thing close, is the attempt resulting in the American Civil War, which did not result in the breakaway of any state.</i>	<i>Precedent does not exist with the U.S. There currently is no mechanism to “undo” a state of the United States. Only thing close, is the attempt resulting in the American Civil War, which did not result in the breakaway of any state.</i>
3.	What is the Nature of Citizenship?	<i>Native Govt – Native Hawaiians Only Native Hawaiians also retain U.S. Citizenship – Dual Citizenship</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation – Native Hawaiians plus Non-Hawaiians through naturalization process.</i>	<i>Hawaiian nationals (all kingdom descendants, including Natives and non-Natives, who choose to repatriate to the Hawaiian</i>

	Issue	Native Hawaiian Government with <u>Dual Citizenship</u> Federal Recognition Advocates	Hawaiian Nation with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Other Advocates	Hawaiian Kingdom Government with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Kingdom Advocates
	What is the Nature of Citizenship Continued....		<i>Any citizen of the Hawaiian Nation is no longer a U.S. Citizen.</i>	<i>Kingdom)</i> <i>Any citizen of the Kingdom is no longer a U.S. Citizen.</i> <i>Non-Hawaiians may become nationals by naturalization or remain as resident aliens like any other foreigner.</i>
4.	What would Territory and Jurisdiction be	<i>Any lands under the jurisdiction and/or control of the Native Govt must be purchased, or negotiated for transfer with the current land holder (ie, OHA, State or Feds etc).</i> <i>No Impact to Privately Held Lands</i>	<i>Entire Hawaiian archipelago under the Native Govt jurisdiction.</i>	<i>Entire Hawaiian archipelago, subject to allodial title, Hawaiian Kingdom laws and international laws governing the repatriation (relinquishment) of land, areas, etc by U.S. Feds, State, etc</i>
5.	What Happens to State?	<i>Status Quo – State of Hawaii government continues to exist and operate as is.</i>	<i>Dissolves – State of Hawaii winds down, dissolves while operation of the infrastructure and services, lands and resources transfer to Hawaiian Nation</i>	<i>Dissolves – State of Hawaii winds down, dissolves while operation of the infrastructure and services, lands and resources transfer to the Kingdom</i>
6.	What Happens to U.S. & Military?	<i>Status Quo – Hawaii continues to be the 50th state of the U.S. Military continues to exist and operate as is.</i>	<i>This is an issue to be decided by Hawaiian Nation and negotiated with U.S.</i>	<i>This is an issue to be decided by Hawaiian Kingdom government and negotiated and stipulated in a bi-lateral treaty.</i>
7.	What Powers Required to Establish?	<i>None – 125,000 enrolled Native Hawaiians convene and establish govt themselves.</i>	<i>State, U.S. & International bodies</i>	<i>State, U.S. & International bodies</i>

	Issue	Native Hawaiian Government with Dual Citizenship Federal Recognition Advocates	Hawaiian Nation with Singular Citizenship Other Advocates	Hawaiian Kingdom Government with Singular Citizenship Kingdom Advocates
8.	What Level of Impact or Disruption can be Expected?	<i>Maximum to Hawaiians on collective issues important to practitioners. Minimal to None to Hawaiians on personal day to day level. Minimal to None to Non-Hawaiians</i>	<i>Maximum to Hawaiian citizens Maximum to Non Hawaiians</i>	<i>Maximum to Hawaiian citizens Maximum to Non- citizens and other residents</i>
9.	Level of Support Required to Establish?	<i>No Minimum Required – 125,000 already enrolled</i>	<i>Maximum Support of both Hawaiians and Non-Hawaiians</i>	<i>Any number of lawful Hawaiian citizens acting under Hawaiian Kingdom and international laws Zero Non-Hawaiian citizens</i>
10.	What are the Powers of the Government	<i>Inherent Sovereignty including housing, education, health, safety etc, as defined in a governing constitution or other organic document ratified by those enrolled. Powers only over lands held by Native govt and Native Hawaiian citizens enrolled. County, State and Federal Laws still in place and continue.</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation has complete power over entire island chain. New Constitution protects all citizens. Non Hawaiian Naturalized citizens can run for all offices except upper House in Legislature.</i>	<i>Kingdom has complete power over entire island chain. Constitution protects all citizens and non-citizens residing in the Hawaiian Kingdom. Any Hawaiian citizen meeting the necessary qualifications may run for office. All residents may live and conduct their business affairs consistent with Kingdom laws</i>
11.	What is the Monetary System & Who is Responsible for the Economy?	<i>Status Quo – U.S. Dollar continues, and economy is based on U.S. economy.</i>	<i>May create new monetary system or use U.S. dollar. Hawaiian Nation responsible for economy.</i>	<i>Would reinstate the Kingdom monetary system, which included the use of US dollars. Kingdom responsible for economy. Economy influenced according to the best interest and welfare of the Kingdom and its citizens and residents</i>

	Issue	Native Hawaiian Government with <u>Dual Citizenship</u> Federal Recognition Advocates	Hawaiian Nation with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Other Advocates	Hawaiian Kingdom Government with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Kingdom Advocates
12.	What Resources will Support Government Operations?	<i>Income from Native govt owned enterprise, land revenues, sales tax on goods, and continuation of federal and state funding for health, housing, education economic development, etc, as well as share of ceded land revenues.</i>	<i>Income from taxes on citizens, on tourism and other usual sources. May lease lands to US military</i>	<i>Income from taxes on citizens and residents, on tourism and other usual sources. Collections of fees for commercial use of Kingdom territories, economic zones and resources. May lease lands to US military</i>
13.	Who is Responsible for National Security?	<i>Status quo – no change, U.S. and State protect Hawaii’s interests.</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation responsible to establish – May develop “free association” with USA for security and other reasons</i>	<i>Kingdom responsible to establish – May develop agreements with USA for security and other reasons</i>
14.	Engagement in International Relations	<i>Native Govt may engage in international relations, including participation at UN, as other Native nations currently do.</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation will engage in international relations with policies influenced through citizen voices.</i>	<i>Kingdom responsible to engage in international relations.</i>
15.	What is Eligibility for Healthcare and Other Social programs?	<i>Status quo – as dual citizens, all Native govt citizens eligible under any and all U.S. health programs, housing subsidies and other social programs including welfare, plus any programs delivered by the Native government.</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation responsible for citizens, Citizens are not eligible for U.S. programs.</i>	<i>Kingdom responsible for its citizens. Citizens are not eligible for U.S. programs.</i>
16.	What Happens to Social Security Eligibility?	<i>Status Quo - Continues unchanged, Native govt citizens are also citizens of U.S. therefore contribute to SS and draw SS.</i>	<i>Any Hawaiian Nation citizen may draw any existing SS, but may not contribute to SS program.</i>	<i>Any Kingdom citizen may draw any existing SS funds, but may not contribute to SS program.</i>

	Issue	Native Hawaiian Government with <u>Dual Citizenship</u> Federal Recognition Advocates	Hawaiian Nation with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Other Advocates	Hawaiian Kingdom Government with <u>Singular Citizenship</u> Kingdom Advocates
17.	What Happens to U.S. Welfare Eligibility?	<i>Status Quo - Continues unchanged, Native govt citizens are also citizens of U.S. therefore eligible for any U.S. welfare or other social net programs</i>	<i>Unavailable to Hawaiian Nation citizens including naturalized citizens.</i>	<i>Unavailable to Kingdom citizens, including naturalized citizens. Continues unchanged for denizens.</i>
18.	Ownership of Private Property	<i>Status Quo – Continues unchanged for anyone in Hawaii. County, State and Federal property laws apply. Native Govt laws apply only to Native Govt property.</i>	<i>Must follow Hawaiian Nation laws</i>	<i>Must follow Kingdom laws</i>
19.	What About Income Taxes?	<i>Status Quo - Continues unchanged, Native govt citizens are also citizens of U.S. therefore income tax laws continue to apply.</i>	<i>Citizens pay to Hawaiian nation, not required to pay U.S. Income Taxes.</i>	<i>Citizens pay to Kingdom, not required to pay U.S. Income Taxes.</i>
20.	Who Controls the Public School System?	<i>Status Quo – continues unchanged, with state of Hawaii and federal resources. Native Govt can engage its own school system within its jurisdiction, and can also influence state and feds policies/resources through govt-to-govt negotiations</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation controls education system entirely</i>	<i>Kingdom controls education system entirely</i>
21.	Who Makes Decisions on Public Water and Lands?	<i>Status Quo – county, state and federal jurisdiction continues including enforcement of PASH.</i>	<i>Hawaiian Nation responsible to establish and enforce</i>	<i>Kingdom responsible to establish and enforce</i>